

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

The Pentecostalization of Global Christianity and the Challenge for Cessationism

JEFFREY P. STRAUB¹

1

INTRODUCTION

Thinking about the men we honor in this Festschrift, all are friends, colleagues and former mentors. Each in his own way contributed to my current ministry. Dr. William W. Combs was a challenge to us as he labored to instill a commitment to handling God's Word carefully. Ever the fastidious exegete, Bill pushed us continually to ask the question, "why does the author say this *here*?" Bill wanted us not just to understand the message of the text but its *authorial* intent, without which correct understanding, the meaning of the text simply couldn't be grasped. One doctrine he worked on was the doctrine of the Holy Spirit. It continues to be a needed study as the essay will demonstrate. Thanks, Bill, Bob, and Bruce, for your faithful service. It is to you men that this essay is dedicated.

PENTECOSTALISM AND THE CHALLENGE OF CESSATIONISM

Since the early twentieth century, with the rise of Pentecostalism and its accompanying belief in the miraculous gifts, evangelicals have repeatedly made the case for cessationism.² Cessationists once were in the majority.³ Pentecostalism, in its American permutations, began as a fringe movement on the edges of Christianity, but now it has so saturated evangelicalism over the past one hundred years that the cessationist position is a minority view. Pentecostalism has grown, assuming its origins in the early 1900s, to become the second largest segment of world Christianity behind Roman Catholicism.⁴

¹ Dr. Straub is Professor of Historical Theology at Central Baptist Theological Seminary in Plymouth, MN.

² Cessationism is the view that certain of the gifts—particularly the miraculous gifts—ceased in early Christian history. A classic expression of this may be found in B. B. Warfield, *Counterfeit Miracles* (repr. of 1918 ed., Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 1972). A recent expression is John MacArthur, *Strange Fire: The Danger of Offending the Holy Spirit with Counterfeit Worship* (Nashville: Nelson, 2013). MacArthur has made this case twice before during his long ministry. See John MacArthur, *The Charismatics* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1978) and John MacArthur, *Charismatic Chaos* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1992).

³ For a summary of major cessationists from church history including John Chrysostom, Augustine, Martin Luther, John Calvin and John Gill, see Nathan Busenitz, "What Cessationism is Not," *The Cripplegate*, May 31, 2013, available online at <http://thecripplegate.com/repost-what-cessationism-is-not/>, accessed May 16, 2016. A form of cessationism is affirmed by *The Westminster Confession* (1.1, continuing revelation) [Presbyterian, 1644] and the *Second London Confession* (1.1) [Baptist, 1689].

⁴ James R. Goff, Jr. and Grant Wacker, "Introduction," *Portraits of a Generation: Early Pentecostal Leaders* (Fayetteville, AR: University of Illinois, 2002), xi.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Yet, Pentecostalism is hardly monolithic. At one end of the spectrum are descendants of early Pentecostals such as the Assemblies of God, founded in 1914.⁵ At the opposite end are syncretistic versions of Pentecostalism as exemplified in many African Initiated Churches (AIC) that emerged in post-colonial Africa.⁶ Pentecostalism, “a religion made to travel,” has gone global.⁷ This paper will set forth the progress of the globalization of Pentecostalism and, in the process, its challenge to cessationism.

2

THE GLOBAL PRESENCE OF PENTECOSTALISM

A Pew Charitable Trust study recently estimated the global Christian population at 2.18 billion among a world population of 6.9 billion. About 50% are Roman Catholic, with 36.7% claiming to be Protestants, another 11.9% Orthodox, leaving 1.3% as “other Christians,” including Mormons and Jehovah’s Witnesses. This essay will not quibble over what is and is not a Christian. The only proper definition of a “Christian” is one who has accepted the Gospel of Jesus Christ and is striving to walk in a manner commensurate with the Word of God. The Pew study, however, factors in the broad range of professing Christendom for the purpose of analyzing the global phenomenon known as *Christianity*.⁸

The global Christian population has increased from 600 million in 1910 to the current levels. During these years, the center of global Christianity has gradually shifted from Europe and the Americas that claimed 93% of Christianity in 1910 down to 63% of the global whole as of 2010. Christianity in Africa jumped from just 9% of the African population to 63% in the same 100-year period. The growth in the Asia/Pacific region more than doubled (from 3% to 7%), which seems fairly unremarkable. What must be understood is that this region contains the two largest countries in the world—China at 1.4 billion and India at 1.1 billion—both of which are largely non-Christian countries. Current figures for China’s Christian population stand at approximately 125.3 million or about 8% of the population.⁹ India is 80% Hindu, leaving the rest of the population to be

⁵ On the early history of the Assemblies of God (AoG), see Edith L. Blumhofer, *The Assemblies of God* (Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing House, 1989) and idem, *Restoring the Faith: The Assemblies of God, Pentecostalism, and American Culture* (Champaign, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1993).

⁶ For a discussion of early movements, see Allan Anderson, *African Reformation: African Initiated Christianity in the 20th Century* (Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 2001). AIC is sometimes used of African Independent Churches or African *Indigenous* Churches. Currently these categories are now referenced as African *Initiated* Churches.

⁷ *The Globalization of Pentecostalism: A Religion Made to Travel*, ed. Murray W. Dempster, et al. (Carlisle, CA: Regnum Books, 1999).

⁸ A summary of the Pew study “Global Christianity—A Report on the Size and Distribution of the World’s Christian Population” is available online at <http://www.pewforum.org/2011/12/19/global-christianity-exec/>, accessed January 26, 2015.

⁹ Estimates of China’s Christian population range widely from 60 million to the figure used here. There are many reasons for the broad range. See Rodney Stark and Xiuhua Wang, *A Star in the East: The Rise of*

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

divided among Muslims who make up the bulk of the remaining 20%, with Christians trailing a distant third.¹⁰

In today's world, Christianity continues to be a major religious presence. What the above paragraph does not explain is the phenomenal growth of Pentecostalism during same 100-year period. Pentecostalism, broadly understood, has grown from its infancy, if one dates its beginning to the early 20th century (more on that later), to approximately 25% of global Christianity, or more than 600 million adherents today. This number includes about 150 million Charismatic Roman Catholics.

When considering the *pentecostalization* of global Christianity, one must ask, "what is a Pentecostal? In what sense is global Christianity becoming *Pentecostal*?" *Pentecostalism*, as opposed to other terms like *charismatic*, *neo-charismatic*, or *neo-Pentecostal*, *Prosperity Gospel*, *Latter Rain*, or *renewalist*, is the best umbrella term to cover the wide range of theological ideas and practices in the global world. Some parameters need to be set.

First, Pentecostalism is hardly a uniform theology with a creed or confession or a central governance structure. Pentecostals themselves admit this problem. "There is no single form of Pentecostalism, nor any clear-cut theological criteria by which it can be defined."¹¹ To be a Roman Catholic is to be identified with the Church of Rome and Pope Francis. One is baptized *into* Catholicism. A good Catholic attends the Mass annually preceded by a visit to a priest for confession.

To be a Pentecostal is much harder to classify. The first challenge is to identify a name that might serve as an umbrella term under which all groups fit. The Center for the Study of Global Christianity of Gordon-Conwell uses *renewalist* as the large category.¹² Others prefer the term *Pentecostal*. "Scholars have attempted various divergent ways of defining Pentecostalism, some of which are ambiguous and of little use, while others attempt to demonstrate 'distinctiveness' and create unnecessarily strained relationships with other Christians as a result."¹³ Four similar and often overlapping strands of global Pentecostalism have been identified. *Classic Pentecostalism* emerged in the early 20th century out of the Azusa Street revival of Los Angeles. The largest group are the

Christianity in China (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 9–12. The 125 million estimate comes from an email to the author February 5, 2015 from Todd Johnson, World Christian Database (WCD), Center for the Study of Global Christianity, Gordon-Conwell Divinity School.

¹⁰ <http://www.reuters.com/article/india-census-religion-idUSKCN0QV0G920150826>, accessed July 7, 2016.

¹¹ Allan Anderson, "The Dynamics of Global Pentecostalism: Origins, Motivations, and Future" in *Spirit of God: Christian Renewal in the Community of Faith*, ed. Jeffrey W. Barbeau and Beth Felker Jones (Downers Grove, InterVarsity Press, 2015), 110.

¹² "Christianity in Its Global Context, 1970–2220: Society, Religion, and Mission," June 2013, 18–19.

¹³ Allan Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 10.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Assemblies of God, at 67.3 million globally.¹⁴ Second are a large number of unaffiliated groups that hold aspects of Pentecostal doctrine and practice called *Independents*. Examples would be churches called African Initiated Churches that emerged in Africa in the early 20th century in the post-colonial era. Third are the *Charismatics*, traditionally non-Pentecostal groups that have come to adopt a measure of Pentecostal theology and practice, such as Charismatic Catholics. A so-called *second wave* of Pentecostal revival began in the United States in the late 1960s and touched the mainline denominations, reaching into the World Council of Churches. Finally, there are independent mega churches, neo-charismatics, and Prosperity Gospelers. These churches have sprung up across the global south in Africa, Latin America, and Asia. They have a huge impact on the changing shape of global Christianity, often exporting their theological particulars back to traditional Christian nations like the United States.¹⁵

Many evangelicals seem unaware of the current state of world Christianity. In 2013, John MacArthur, Jr., at the *Strange Fire* conference, addressed the growing pressures within evangelicalism from burgeoning Pentecostalism.¹⁶ MacArthur wanted to sound an alarm over a movement deemed unbiblical, warning about egregious, unbiblical teachings such as the Prosperity Gospel which often attend Pentecostal churches. Yet many evangelicals argued that MacArthur overstated things.

MacArthur called attention to a movement that since its inception has radically altered the landscape of world Christianity. Current estimates suggest that Pentecostalism is growing at a rate of 35,000 new adherents globally every day. One in four professing Christians is now a Pentecostal. Global Pentecostalism could exceed 800 million adherents by 2025.¹⁷

¹⁴ "Statistics of the Assemblies of God," available at [http://agchurches.org/Sitefiles/Default/RSS/AG.org%20TOP/AG%20Statistical%20Reports/2015%20\(year%202014%20reports\)/Online%20Stats%202014.pdf](http://agchurches.org/Sitefiles/Default/RSS/AG.org%20TOP/AG%20Statistical%20Reports/2015%20(year%202014%20reports)/Online%20Stats%202014.pdf), accessed April 22, 2016.

¹⁵ Anderson used these categories in a paper, "The Growth of Global Pentecostalism," delivered at the Wheaton Theology Conference 4, April 3, 2014.

¹⁶ MacArthur released his third critique of Pentecostalism in conjunction with this conference. John MacArthur, *Strange Fire: The Danger of Offending the Holy Spirit with Counterfeit Worship* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2013).

¹⁷ "The Pentecostal Renewal," *World Christian Encyclopedia*, (New York: Oxford, 2000), 1:19–20. A recent projection, prepared for the Pentecostal World Fellowship held in August 2013, put the number at 710 million by 2020. See "Pentecostals in Global Context," a study specially prepared for the Pentecostal World Fellowship, August 27–30, 2013, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. Published by the Center for the Study of Global Christianity, Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

PENTECOSTALISM: TOWARD A THEOLOGICAL IDENTITY

To understand the growth of this movement, one must understand what makes a Pentecostal. Are Pentecostals evangelicals? Is belief in the Good News part of the *sine qua non* of Pentecostalism? While many Pentecostals would fall into the category of evangelical,¹⁸ many would not. Therefore, what makes a Pentecostal? Unlike Roman Catholicism, Pentecostalism has no theological standard by which to evaluate the global whole. Despite variations, at the heart of Pentecostalism is the belief in the unique work of the Holy Spirit. “The term ‘Pentecostal’ is appropriate for describing globally all churches and movements that emphasize the working of the gifts of the Spirit, both on phenomenological and on theological grounds—although not without qualification.”¹⁹

This theological understanding—the present ministry of the Holy Spirit—is only the beginning of the story. Pentecostalism cannot be defined in purely doctrinal terms. There is a complex of practices that commonly attend Pentecostalism, including divine healing, speaking in tongues, and prophetic utterances. The prosperity gospel, pervasive in contemporary Pentecostalism, is of more recent origin and not a part of the *sine qua non* of historic Pentecostalism.²⁰ Pentecostals, in their praxis, are diversified and no two Pentecostals believe exactly alike.²¹

TWENTIETH CENTURY PENTECOSTALISM: A SUMMARY

Older historians describe three waves of Pentecostal development particularly in North America. Scholars today take a polygenetic approach. To speak of three waves fails adequately to account for significant American aspects of Pentecostalism, much less for worldwide developments. While global antecedents predated Azusa Street, once the

¹⁸ For example, the AG have a clear statement regarding their view of salvation that lists this doctrine as one of four cardinal doctrines, along with baptism in the Spirit as a second work of grace, divine healing based on the atonement, and the blessed hope. See “Assemblies of God Fundamental Truths,” available online at http://ag.org/top/Beliefs/Statement_of_Fundamental_Truths/sft_short.cfm, accessed February 1, 2015.

¹⁹ Anderson, *Introduction*, 13–14.

²⁰ For more on Pentecostal definition, see Robert Anderson, *Vision of the Disinherited: The Making of American Pentecostalism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1979), 4.

²¹ “Pentecostalism comes in a bewildering variety of forms, each marked by tremendous internal diversity.... The sheer size of the movement is staggering, and its immensity issues in confusion. It is impossible to give precise parameters for this experience-oriented tradition, but adherents generally share at least two suppositions. They agree that the gifts of the Holy Spirit described in the New Testament should operate in the church today. They also believe that Christians should experience a distinct “filling” or “baptism” with the Holy Spirit, but they disagree about how this will be evidenced” (Blumhofer, *Restoring the Faith*, 1).

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

early 20th century American Pentecostalism began, Azusa Street would be the main impetus for a movement that reached around the world.²²

FROM CHARLES PARHAM TO THE THIRD WAVE

If Pentecostalism is a broad movement with many adherents, when did it begin? Only a summary of its historical roots and development may be offered. Pentecostals argue that the manifestation of the Holy Spirit has been in the life of the Church since the apostolic era. "What emerges from a study of the sources is the picture of a Church which is strongly charismatic up until a.d. 200."²³ After 200, even Pentecostals admit the charismata seem to disappear, at least for a time. This absence of the charismata throughout history does not bother many Pentecostals. Some "do not really want a history. One of the claims of some Spirit-filled Christians is that the Spirit simply descended on their antecedents after nineteen relatively quiet centuries, but almost exactly as this Spirit came on the original Pentecost."²⁴ Other continuationists argue that there is no reason to deny the ongoing manifestations of the Holy Spirit down through the centuries. "There is enough evidence that some form of 'charismatic' gifts continued sporadically across the centuries that it is futile to insist on doctrinaire grounds that every report is spurious or the fruit of demoniac activity or psychological aberration."²⁵ However, even Pentecostal historians generally date the rise of Pentecostalism to the 20th century, noting historical antecedents.²⁶

The First Wave of Pentecostalism

Many date the rise of Pentecostalism²⁷ to Charles Parham (1873–1929) and the Bethel Bible School of Topeka, Kansas (1900). Agnes Ozman, a student in Parham's school, allegedly

²² Anderson, "The Dynamics of Global Pentecostalism," 112–15.

²³ Ronald A. Kydd, *Charismatic Gifts in the Early Church* (Peabody, MA: Hendricksen, 1984), 4.

²⁴ Martin Marty, "Foreward," Donald Dayton, *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1987), 10.

²⁵ D. A. Carson, *Showing the Spirit: A Theological Exposition of 1 Corinthians 12–14* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1987), 166.

²⁶ Two sources in particular trace historical antecedents of modern 20th century Pentecostalism. See Dayton, *Theological Roots and Aspects of Pentecostal-Charismatic Origins*, ed. Vinson Synan (Plainfield, NJ: Bridge-Logos, 1975).

²⁷ Some of the more important histories of Pentecostalism include Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism*; Harvey Cox, *Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-first Century* (Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1995); Walter Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism: Origins and Development Worldwide* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1997); Vinson Synan, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Movement in the United States* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1971); Vinson Synan, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1997); Vinson Synan, *The Century of the Holy Spirit: 100 Years of Pentecostal and Charismatic Renewal* (Nashville:

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

spoke in Chinese, marking the beginning of the modern tongues movement.²⁸ Xenolalia,²⁹ the supernatural ability to speak in *foreign languages*, became an early hallmark. Parham's personal story is unremarkable: his leadership of the new movement was virtually non-existent. Direction fell to William Seymour, his erstwhile student who, after a brief time at Bethel, took Parham's doctrine to Los Angeles. In 1909, "revival" broke out.³⁰ After several years, the crowds subsided and the work floundered. But the revival had had its effect. Men and women visited Azusa Street, claimed the baptism of the Spirit with its attending sign of tongues, and carried the message around the world. Early Pentecostals went overseas as missionaries, convinced that tongues would guarantee their success. Surely God would grant them ability to speak in the languages of the heathen.³¹ However, early Pentecostal missionary expansion tells another story. Repeatedly, missionaries met with failure as no xenolalia was forthcoming. Moreover, most were ill-equipped to learn a language. Additionally, they falsely assumed that they would be miraculously protected from the strange diseases that plagued other missionaries. They too succumbed to malaria, fatigue, and malnutrition. The expected Holy Spirit blessing seemed to elude them.

These initial failures presented a significant problem for early Pentecostals. What should be made of the gift of tongues? Their failures at xenolalia led them to modify their

Thomas Nelson, 2001); and Grant Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001). The aforementioned histories are academic in orientation. On a popular level, see Jack Hayford, *The Charismatic Century: The Enduring Impact of the Azusa Street Revival* (New York: Word, 2006). A strong case for tracing global Pentecostalism to these American origins is Cecil M. Robeck, Jr., "Launching a Global Movement: The Role of Azusa Street in Pentecostalism's Growth and Expansion," in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 42–62.

²⁸ For a recent study of Parham, see James R. Goff, *Fields White Unto Harvest: Charles F. Parham and the Missionary Origins of Pentecostalism* (Fayetteville, AR: University of Arkansas Press, 1988).

²⁹ *Xenolalia* is used specifically in this paper to identify the phenomenon of speaking in a *known* language as opposed to *glossolalia* that refers to speaking in an *unknown* (angelic) language. Pentecostal literature generally calls every kind of manifestation either *tongues* or *glossolalia*. There have even been reported cases of "graphalalia" (writing in tongues). See Robeck, *Azusa Street*, 112–15, and Vinson Synan, "George Floyd Taylor: Conflicts and Crowns," *Portraits of a Generation*, 334.

³⁰ On Seymour and Azusa Street, see Cecil M. Robeck, Jr., *Azusa Street Mission and Revival: The Birth of Global Pentecostalism* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2006) and Vinson Synan and Charles R. Fox, Jr., *William Seymour: Pioneer of the Azusa Street Revival* (Alachua, FL: Bridge-Logos, 2012).

³¹ In the first issue (September 1906) of *The Apostolic Faith*, the periodical produced by William Seymour to promote the revival, their expectation was crystal clear: "They fully expected through Spirit baptism to be able to speak 'all the languages of the world' in order to preach the gospel 'into all the world.'" Original article cited by Allan Anderson, *Spreading Fires: The Missionary Nature of Early Pentecostalism* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2007), 53.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

understanding of tongues from a gift of human languages to that of *unknown* tongues.³² Henceforth, the missionaries became not so much evangelists of the Gospel as evangelists of the Holy Spirit, converting other missionaries to the Pentecostal experience. The Azusa Pentecostalism grew, split, expanded, and spread around the world. However, with all the growth and development, Pentecostalism remained at the fringes of Christianity. Responses to the unusual behavior came from orthodox Christians and from those outside the Church. It was not until the 1950s and 1960s that fortunes changed and the movement caught the attention of the mainline denominations.

The Second Wave of Pentecostalism

The later history of Pentecostalism is vast and complex. Early Pentecostalism remained at the fringes through the first half of the 20th century. By the 1950s, Pentecostalism began to emerge in unexpected places. A new round of healing revivals led by men like William Branham (1909–1965) and Granville Oral Roberts (1918–2009) occurred. Roberts played a large role in the popularizing of Pentecostalism, first by radio and later by television, getting in on the ground floor of both. Mass media gave Pentecostalism access to a larger audience. Others, including Kathryn Kuhlman (1907–1976) and Rex Humbard (1919–2007), effectively used these means to deliver the message of faith healing to a wider audience beyond the tent meetings or in Pentecostal chapels.³³

As Pentecostalism spread, it began to infiltrate mainline churches. In April 1960, an Episcopal minister stood before his congregation and recounted his recent baptism of the Holy Spirit with tongues. Pandemonium erupted. By the end of the day, Dennis Bennett had resigned. Pentecostal renewal was again at the forefront, his story appearing in *Time* and *Newsweek*.³⁴ The Charismatic movement had begun.³⁵

³² “There are indications that by the end of 1907, Seymour and his coworkers were gradually giving up on ‘missionary tongues’ and that this belief was being replaced by one in ‘unknown tongues,’ the almost universal belief of Pentecostals today” (Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, 60).

³³ The contours of this era of Pentecostal history are discussed in David Edwin Harrell, Jr. *All Things Are Possible: The Healing and Charismatic Revivals in Modern America* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1975). On Oral Roberts, see idem, *Oral Roberts: An American Life* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1985).

³⁴ “Speaking in Tongues,” *Time*, August 15, 1960, 53. Also “Rector and a Rumpus,” *Newsweek*, July 4, 1960, 77.

³⁵ The movement is also called Neo Pentecostalism. See David Yamane, “The Charismatic Movement,” *Encyclopedia of Religion and Society*, available online at <http://hrr.hartsem.edu/ency/cmovement.htm>, accessed August 7, 2014.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Bennett traveled widely influencing mainline churches; Lutherans, Baptists, and Presbyterians were exposed to the Pentecostal message.³⁶ The movement reached the World Council of Churches through David DuPlessis (1905–1997). Even Roman Catholics were touched by “renewal” when a group of students manifested an assortment of signs from tongues, to falling on the floor, to uncontrollable laughter. Soon Notre Dame University was drawing large crowds at annual conferences, exceeding 30,000 by 1973. The Catholic renewal spread to other countries and John Paul II gave his blessing.³⁷

Pentecostals moved from the fringes of Christianity into the mainline and then on to the evangelical wing. Most early evangelicals opposed the movement. However, when Pentecostals joined the National Association of Evangelicals, their popularity grew exponentially.³⁸ Pentecostalism now was accepted within the evangelical fold and considered an acceptable form of Christianity.

The Third Wave of Pentecostalism

Third wave Pentecostalism began when John Wimber (1934–1997) and C. Peter Wagner (b. 1930) joined hands in teaching a class at Fuller Theological Seminary: “Signs, Wonders and Church Growth.” They argued for “power evangelism” (evangelism accompanied by miracles) as a means of promoting church growth. Soon there was a Vineyard movement with 5,000 churches world-wide.³⁹ This was followed by “The Toronto Blessing” and the Brownsville Revival. Eventually mainstream evangelicals like Sam Storms⁴⁰ and Wayne Grudem promoted a version of Pentecostalism.⁴¹

³⁶ The story of Bennett is recounted in Hayford, *The Charismatic Century*, 189–97. Also Dennis J. Bennett, *Nine O’ Clock in the Morning* (Alachua, FL: Bridge-Logos, 1970).

³⁷ For an early, sympathetic history of the Catholic Charismatic renewal, see Edward D. O’Connor, *The Pentecostal Movement in the Catholic Church* (Notre Dame, IN: Ava Maria Press, 1971). Also Peter Hocken, “The Catholic Charismatic Renewal,” in *The Century of the Holy Spirit: 100 Years of Pentecostal and Charismatic Renewal*, ed. Vinson Synan (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2001); and Jack Hayford, *The Charismatic Century*, 217–47.

³⁸ From the NAE’s inception in 1942, Pentecostalism, which had been excluded from previous conservative coalitions, was welcomed into evangelicalism—to the point that by 1958, nearly two-thirds of the NAE membership was Pentecostal, from one of five groups: Assemblies of God, Church of God (Cleveland), International Church of the Foursquare Gospel, Pentecostal Church of God, and the Pentecostal Holiness Church. See “History,” <http://nae.net/about-nae/history/>, accessed April 22, 2016.

³⁹ <http://www.vineyardusa.org/site/about/vineyard-history>, accessed August 1, 2014.

⁴⁰ <http://www.samstorms.com/enjoying-god-blog>, accessed August 1, 2014.

⁴¹ Wayne Grudem, *Systematic Theology* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1994, 2000); also his edited work *Are Miraculous Gifts for Today? Four Views* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1996); and *The Gift of Prophecy in the New Testament and Today* (Wheaton: Crossway, 1988, 2000).

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

By the end of the 20th century, Pentecostalism had spread throughout American Christianity. Southern Baptist John Osteen left the Convention after he was baptized with the Holy Spirit in 1958. Today his church, pastored by son Joel, is the largest church in the United States with a membership of over 42,000. Southern Baptists in recent years have agonized over aspects of Pentecostalism.⁴² Pentecostalism is everywhere and it is growing larger every day.

PENTECOSTAL EXTREMES: THE PROSPERITY GOSPEL

As the Pentecostal movement approached the end of the 20th century, a significant development greatly contributed to its expansion—the Health and Wealth Gospel, often dubbed “The Prosperity Gospel” (PG). Preachers of the PG include some of the most prominent names in modern Pentecostalism—Kenneth and Gloria Copeland, Joyce Meyers, Creflo Dollar, Benny Hinn, Paula White, and others. All of these preachers live lavish lifestyles and promote a gospel of material prosperity.⁴³

The Prosperity Gospel finds its origin in the teaching of Essek William Kenyon (1867–1948), a Keswick-influenced Baptist, who was not strictly a Pentecostal. Kenyon, converted at age seventeen in a Methodist church, had little religious influence as a boy. He began pastoring at nineteen but fell away from God. He came back to God in a service at A. J. Gordon’s Clarendon Street Baptist Church of Boston. He was ordained by Freewill Baptists, pastoring in Baptist circles.⁴⁴ Gordon’s book *The Ministry of the Holy Spirit* was influential in shaping Kenyon’s budding theology.⁴⁵ But Kenyon far exceeded Gordon’s view of the power of faith. According to Kenyon, “Hope says, ‘I will get it sometime.’ Faith says, ‘I have it now.’ ”⁴⁶

Others embraced and expanded Kenyon’s “name it and claim it” theology including Fred F. Bosworth (1877–1958), Oral Roberts,⁴⁷ and Kenneth Hagin (1917–2003). “Bosworth

⁴² “Southern Baptist Agency Disallows ‘Private Prayer Language.’ ” *The Christian Century*, December 27, 2005, available online at <http://www.christiancentury.org/article/2005-12/southern-baptist-agency-disallows-private-prayer-language>, accessed February 3, 2015.

PG Prosperity Gospel

⁴³ For a recent history of the Prosperity Gospel, see Kate Bowler, *Blessed: A History of the American Prosperity Gospel* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013). A critique of the movement from within Pentecostalism is Gordon D. Fee, *The Diseases of the Health and Wealth Gospels* (Vancouver, BC: Regent College Publishing, 1995, 2006).

⁴⁴ For a sympathetic biography of Kenyon, see Joe McIntyre, *E. W. Kenyon and His Message of Faith: The True Story* (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 1997).

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, 36.

⁴⁶ E. W. Kenyon, *Two Kinds of Faith: Faith’s Secret Revealed* (Lynnwood, WA: Gospel Publishing Society, 1942), 7, quoted in Bowler, *Blessed*, 43.

⁴⁷ For Oral Roberts’s role in the development of the Prosperity Gospel see Bowler, *Blessed*, 48ff.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

shared Kenyon's conclusion that healing was a legal right, secured by Christ, and accelerated through spiritual effects of positive words."⁴⁸ Hagin became the father of "the Word of Faith" movement, influencing Kenneth Copeland who impacted men like Creflo Dollar. Hagin's successors went too far in their prosperity views and Hagin sought a corrective. At a meeting of some of his most devout followers, he warned them of their misapplication of his teaching. Shortly before Hagin died, he published *The Midas Touch: A Balanced Approach to Biblical Prosperity*.⁴⁹ Just how seriously those who attended the meeting heeded their mentor's rebuke is a matter of debate.⁵⁰

The largest church in the United States is Lakewood Church of Houston, Texas, pastored by Joel Osteen. The church exudes a prosperity mindset. Osteen's father John started Lakewood in 1959. Under John's leadership, the church grew to 6,000. It included a large TV ministry. Son Joel (b. 1963), who had attended one semester at Oral Roberts University, worked on the production side of the television ministry. Joel showed no inclination toward ministry. On January 17, 1999, Joel preached his first sermon, just days before his father's death. Joel soon filled the pulpit of his late father and was installed as his successor.⁵¹

Joel Osteen is considered among the most influential men in America. In 2004, his book, *Your Best Life Now*, made it to the *New York Times* Bestseller's List with sales topping four million copies. In 2006, Barbara Walters named Joel as one of "The 10 Most Fascinating People" and *Church Report Magazine* named him as "The Most Influential Christian of 2006."⁵² Pentecostalism had finally arrived.

GLOBAL PENTECOSTALISM IN THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY

Pentecostalism today is a global movement. Look at any part of the world and one finds amazing statistics on its growth and impact. Pentecostalism reached Africa in the aftermath of Azusa Street and now boasts about 200 million adherents, a staggering 63% of which are Neo Pentecostals. Nigeria has 84.5 million Christians out of 183.5 million people, 56 million who claim Pentecostalism. In South Africa, 24 million of 43.8 million Christians are Pentecostal in a country of 55 million. Similar figures could be listed for

⁴⁸ Ibid., 21.

⁴⁹ N.p.: Faith Library Productions, 2002, available online at <http://www.ekklesia.lt/wp-content/uploads/2011/08/Kenneth-E-Hagin-The-Midas-Touch.pdf>, accessed August 4, 2014.

⁵⁰ See J. Lee Grady, "Kenneth Hagin's Forgotten Warning," http://www.cbn.com/spirituallife/churchandministry/Grady_Hagin_Prosperty.aspx, accessed August 4, 2014.

⁵¹ <http://www.joelosteen.com/Pages/AboutJoel.aspx>, accessed July 30, 2014.

⁵² Ibid.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

The Democratic Republic of Congo.⁵³ Pentecostalism has become an African phenomenon that shows no signs of abating.

Statistical growth of Pentecostalism in Latin America is equally stunning. There were 12.6 million Pentecostals in 1970, but that number mushroomed to 156.9 million as of 2006. The percentage of Pentecostals rose during the same period from 4.4% of the population to 28.1%. Pentecostals approached 65% of all Protestants by 2014. The countries with the largest number of Pentecostals are Brazil, Chile, Argentina, Guatemala, El Salvador, and Nicaragua all having more than 10% of their national populations identifying as some form of Pentecostal. Guatemala has the highest proportion of Pentecostals with a staggering 60% of the country's estimated population of 13 million.⁵⁴

Asia, despite having more than one half of the world's population, has the smallest presence of Pentecostalism among major world regions. But small does not mean insignificant, and Asia boasts the largest church in the world which also happens to be Pentecostal. Asia is also home to the second largest Pentecostal population base, second only to Latin America. As of 2005, Latin America, Asia, and Africa had three quarters of the world's Pentecostals.⁵⁵ Asian countries with the highest number of Pentecostals proportionately are South Korea and the Philippines. China, the world's largest country, has an estimated 125.3 million Christians, a little less than half of which are renewalist. WCD estimates that of the nearly 61 million renewalists, just over 57 million are neo-charismatics.⁵⁶

⁵³ This number gleaned from the World Christian Database, August 4, 2014. It represents about 40% of the total Christian population. Another source suggests that African renewalists comprise only one third of all Christians in Africa. See Kevin P. Emmert, "Surprise, the African Church is not very Charismatic," *Christianity Today*, October 16, 2013, available online at <http://www.christianitytoday.com/ct/2013/october-web-only/african-church-charismatic-pentecostal-cessationist.html?paging=off>, accessed August 7, 2014.

⁵⁴ Data from *Spirit and Power* and "Overview: Pentecostalism in Latin America," Pew Charitable Trust, October 5, 2006, available at <http://www.pewforum.org/2006/10/05/overview-pentecostalism-in-latin-america/>, accessed February 6, 2015. For another recent general discussion on the history and growth of Pentecostalism in Latin America, see Anderson, *Introduction to Pentecostalism*, 71–90.

⁵⁵ Allan Anderson, "Introduction," *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia*, ed. Allen Anderson and Edmond Tang (Baguio City, Philippines: Regnum Books, 2005), 2. There is now a 2nd ed. (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2011).

WCD World Christian Database

⁵⁶ Estimates for Chinese Pentecostalism, courtesy of Todd Johnson, WCD, Gordon-Conwell Divinity School, email to the author, February 5, 2015.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

THE PROSPERITY GOSPEL AND THE GROWTH OF GLOBAL PENTECOSTALISM

Reasons for the growth of global Pentecostalism are many and varied. While the movement went international in the early 20th century, the advent of the PG, coupled with mass media including the internet, may make Pentecostalism America's most successful export. Of recent American origin, the PG quickly became a global phenomenon. Rehearsing the depth of its transnational influence would take a book-length study. Even examining its African permutations can be mind-numbing. Preachers whose personal wealth is astonishing operate in many African countries. Many of these prosperity promoters "preach" in some of the world's poorest countries but they live lifestyles of royalty. The connections between African PG preachers and their American mentors are sometimes obvious. Benson Idahosa (1938–1998) of Benin City, Nigeria, is a case in point. He was initially educated among the Salvation Army and the Methodists in the 1950s. In 1971, he attended Christ for the Nations Institute of Dallas, Texas, founded by Gordon Lindsay (1906–1973).⁵⁷ After only one semester he returned to Africa with a burning desire to impact Nigeria for Christ. Idahosa founded the Church of God International Mission. Oral Roberts University conferred an honorary doctorate on him in 1984, a sign of their approval of his theology. He and his movement are said to have planted 6000 churches in Nigeria and Ghana before 1971. He had a healing ministry and even claimed to have raised the dead. One biographer noted that "his burden for souls, his ministry of healing and miracles, even to the raising of several dead, demonstrates he is especially called of the Lord in these end times."⁵⁸ Idahosa influenced the current generation of African PG preachers like David Oyedepo.⁵⁹

PG Prosperity Gospel

PG Prosperity Gospel

PG Prosperity Gospel

⁵⁷ On Lindsay, see *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, s.v. "Lindsay, Gordon and Freda Theresa," by D. D. Bundy (hereafter *NIDPCM*), 539–40. Lindsay's prosperity views may be found in Gordon Lindsay, *God's Master Key to Success and Prosperity* (Dallas: Voice of Healing, 1959). Lindsay's message is traceable to Bosworth and through him back to Kenyon (see Bowler, *Blessed*, 22).

⁵⁸ Mrs. Freda Theresa Lindsay, quoted in a biographical sketch of Benson Idahosa, *Dictionary of African Christian Biography*, available online at http://www.dacb.org/stories/nigeria/idahosa_bensona.html, accessed August 4, 2014.

PG Prosperity Gospel

⁵⁹ See Israel Olofinjana, "Benson Andrew Idahosa (1938–1998): Father of Nigerian Pentecostalism," available online at <http://israelolofinjana.wordpress.com/about/>, accessed August 4, 2014. For a discussion of the American Prosperity Gospel's influence in Africa, see Asonzeh Ukah, "African Christianities: Features, Promises, and Problems," Institut für Ethnologie und Afrikanstudien, Arbeitspapiere #79 available online at <http://www.ifeas.uni-mainz.de/Dateien/AP79.pdf>, accessed August 4, 2014.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Many African mega-ministry PG preachers have international influence. Kenya's Winner's Chapel of Nairobi is the largest auditorium in Central and East Africa, seating about 20,000. The Winner's Chapel movement, the Living Faith Church Worldwide, is headed by Oyedepo. Begun in 1983, the movement boasts 300 churches across Nigeria and around the world. Recently, Oyedepo was listed in *Forbes* as the wealthiest pastor in Nigeria.⁶⁰ The Deeper Life Bible Church, started in 1973 by William Folorunso Kumuyi (b. 1941) of Lagos, today claims 120,000 members, making it the third largest church in the world.⁶¹ Many others could be listed.

Africa is not alone in feeling the effects of prosperity theology. Latin America and Asia have experienced similar forces and similar accounts could be told. But the PG alone is insufficient to explain the phenomenal growth of world Pentecostalism. It is now time to survey the global progress of Pentecostal doctrine, what Harvey Cox calls "the Pentecostal-Charismatic tsunami."⁶²

So dominant has Pentecostalism become that the world's largest church is Yoido Full Gospel Church of Seoul, South Korea, founded by David Yonggi Cho,⁶³ with a membership of 700,000. It is a prime example of the far-reaching force of Pentecostalism.⁶⁴ The story of the church's growth is nothing short of stunning. The church began in 1958 in the home of Choi Jashil. Jashil and his co-pastor Cho Yonggi visited a paralyzed woman over whom they prayed. She was healed, sparking the church's phenomenal growth. It reached 1,000 members in 1961 and 3,000 by 1964. The membership hit 8,000 in 1968.

Once membership topped 10,000, the church moved to Seoul's Yoido Island and built a new building. By the inaugural service, there were 18,000 members. The membership topped 50,000 by 1977 and doubled two years later. More buildings were built, and within two years another 100,000 members were added.

PG Prosperity Gospel

⁶⁰ <http://www.forbes.com/sites/mfonobongnsehe/2011/06/07/the-five-richest-pastors-in-nigeria/>, accessed August 4, 2014.

⁶¹ <http://www.dclm.org/content/pastor-wf-kumuyi>, accessed July 29, 2014.

PG Prosperity Gospel

⁶² Harvey Cox, "Foreword," to Carol Gunther Brown, *Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Healing* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), xx.

⁶³ Many have accused Cho of being a proponent of the Prosperity Gospel. For a Pentecostal analysis of that claim, see Allen Anderson, "The Contribution of David Yonggi Cho to a Contextual Theology in Korea," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 12 (2003): 85–105.

⁶⁴ http://www.yfgc.org/n_english/fg_church/yfgc_yoido.asp, accessed July 29, 2014.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Having reached 200,000 members, the growth of the church never stopped but continued until the membership reached 400,000 by October of 1984, making YFGC the fastest growing church in the world. The growth continued to 500,000 in 1985, and to 700,000 in 1992. Even though Regional Chapels began to be established in the early 1980s throughout Seoul's many districts and wards, becoming [sic] independent churches with certain freedom of autonomous control draining the membership of YFGC continued to grow to 700,000, which testifies to the work of the Holy Spirit.⁶⁵

Three of the world's largest churches—Yoido, Deeper Life and Lakewood, with a combined membership approaching one million members, in such diverse countries as the United States, South Korea, and Nigeria, suggests that Pentecostalism has come of age. Its presence is ubiquitous, its growth is astonishing, and its influence is global. How did Pentecostalism, with its relatively insignificant beginnings, come to dominate and transform *world* Christianity at the beginning of the 21st century?⁶⁶

PENTECOSTALISM IN AFRICA

Africa, a continent of approximately one billion, has a Pentecostal population of between 150 and 250 million adherents.⁶⁷ At the 2014 Conference of the American Missiological Society, the findings of a study of African Christian reading habits was presented. More than 8,000 surveys were collected from from three countries—Kenya, an Anglophone country, with the largest number of respondents, followed by the Central African Republic (Francophone), and Angola (Lusophone). These countries all claim a Christian majority, from as high as 87% in Kenya to as low as 57% in the CAR. Among the most widely read authors in Kenya were Prosperity Gospelers Joel Osteen (#2), Joyce Meyer

⁶⁵ Information on the growth of this church is taken from its website, http://www.yfgc.org/n_english/fg_church/yfgc_yoido.asp, accessed July 29, 2014.

⁶⁶ Pentecostals themselves are keenly aware of their global presence. Noted Pentecostal historian Allan Heaton Anderson, who served as a Pentecostal pastor for over two decades in South Africa before studying at the University of Birmingham under Walter J. Hollenweger, has recently surveyed this very issue in *To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013). See attached Appendix One for a discussion on Pentecostal historiography.

⁶⁷ Estimating the number of Pentecostals worldwide, much less in Africa, is extremely difficult. In 2006, African Pentecostals were estimated to be around 107 million of a population of 890 million. In 2013, the estimate was one third of all Christians. Compare "Overview: Pentecostalism in Africa," *Spirit and Power*, available online at <http://www.pewforum.org/2006/10/05/overview-pentecostalism-in-africa/>, accessed May 8, 2016, with Kevin P. Emmert, "Surprise: The African Church is Not Very Charismatic," *Christianity Today*, October 16, 2013, available online at <http://www.christianitytoday.com/ct/2013/october-web-only/african-church-charismatic-pentecostal-cessationist.html>, accessed May 8, 2016. The current estimate for Pentecostalism in Africa is 202,623,000. Their number is projected to grow to nearly 420 million by 2050 (email from Peter Crossing, WCD, to the author, May 10, 2016).

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

(tied with Rick Warren) at #6, and T. D. Jakes (#8). The survey examined books for sale at three kinds of bookstores—Christian, commercial booksellers, and street vendors. Joyce Meyer and T.D. Jakes neared the top in all three countries. Bahamian Pentecostal Myles Monroe⁶⁸ and Joel Osteen were also near the top.⁶⁹ From this survey, it seems that Pentecostalism has permeated Africa.⁷⁰

Early African Pentecostalism

African Pentecostal growth is nothing short of stunning with missionaries being “the greatest purveyors of Pentecostal spirituality.”⁷¹ Early Pentecostal missionaries included John Graham Lake (1870–1935) of South Africa. In 1898 while still living in Chicago, he took an invalid brother to Pentecostal forerunner John Alexander Dowie for healing.⁷² Lake joined Dowie’s Zion Catholic Apostolic Church, becoming an elder. In 1907, Lake travelled to Azusa Street where he claimed the baptism of the Holy Spirit. With several others, he headed to South Africa. Though his wife soon died, Lake persevered, eventually founding the Apostolic Faith Mission (AFM).⁷³ Another American Azusa Street enthusiast, Thomas Hezmalhalch (1848–1934), assisted him.⁷⁴ Together they promoted Pentecostal theology throughout South Africa. Today their AFM is the largest Pentecostal group in South Africa with an estimated membership of 1.4 million. They

⁶⁸ For an example of Monroe’s prosperity teaching, see “Kingdom Principles for a Financial Harvest” and the endorsement of Benny Hinn, available online at

<http://www.bennyhinn.org/articles/articledesc.cfm?id=3388>, accessed April 13, 2016.

⁶⁹ Robert J. Priest, et al., “Examining the Authors Being Read by African Christians,” a paper read at the annual meeting of the Evangelical Missiological Society, June 14, 2014.

⁷⁰ For two recent studies on African Pentecostalism, see J. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu, *Contemporary Pentecostal Christianity: Interpretations from an African Context* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2013) and *Pentecostal Theology in Africa*, ed. Clifton R. Clarke (Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2014).

⁷¹ Ogbu Kalu, *African Pentecostalism: An Introduction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 47.

⁷² On Dowie, see Grant Wacker et al., “John Alexander Dowie: Harbinger of Pentecostal Power,” in *Portraits of a Generation*, 2–19.

⁷³ Studies of early Pentecostal leaders often fall into two categories—hagiographic pieces written by admirers and harshly critical essays. The best of the first variety on Lake would be Gordon Lindsay, *John G. Lake: Apostle to Africa* (Dallas: Christ for the Nations, 1981). An example of the latter would be Barry Morton, “‘The Devil Who Heals’: Fraud and Falsification in the Evangelical Career of John G. Lake, Missionary to South Africa 1908–1913,” *African Historical Review* 44 (2012): 98–118. Morton’s assessment of Lake was that he was “simply put, a fraud (or ‘con man’ or ‘false prophet,’ depending on one’s outlook) throughout his entire career, a preacher who consciously used deception both to gain tithe-paying adherents, and to defraud and control them once they were in his organization” (99).

⁷⁴ See *NIDPCM*, s.v. “Hezmalhalch, Thomas,” by W. E. Warner, 712.

AFM Apostolic Faith Mission

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

have churches in 29 countries.⁷⁵ From South Africa, Pentecostalism, via the AFM, made its way into Zimbabwe in 1915 and Malawi in 1933.⁷⁶ However, early western Pentecostalism was stymied by racial segregation. Some questioned whether blacks could speak in tongues.⁷⁷

In addition to western influences, there have been numerous indigenous African Pentecostal-type movements today called African Initiated Churches. Examples here are plentiful and there is debate as to how to link these indigenous movements with their western cousins.⁷⁸ The Aladura (“praying people” in Yoruba) movement is an early form of AIC, beginning in Nigeria in the 1920s. Typical of AICs, Aladura emerged out of the mainline churches as western mission agencies withdrew from Africa during the declining years of colonialism.⁷⁹

The list of Pentecostal-type early leaders whose careers mimic western Pentecostals is long and the influence of these trailblazers is vast. One early AIC leader was William Wade Harris (1865–1929) of Liberia. He became a Christian while attending a Methodist school. As a teacher at the American Protestant Episcopal Mission for ten years, he claimed a vision of Gabriel calling him to be a prophet. In 1913, he made a preaching tour through the Ivory Coast and the Gold Coast carrying a Bible, a rattle, a bowl for baptisms, a cross, and a staff. He was accompanied by two women who served as his assistants. Among his Pentecostal-type manifestations were healings, exorcisms, tongues, and visions.⁸⁰

Other early African Pentecostal-type leaders include Garrick Braide (ca. 1882–1918) and Simon Kimbangu (ca. 1887–1951). Braide, considered by some as the first Pentecostal pioneer in Nigeria, came out of the Nigerian Anglican tradition. By 1908 he claimed the gift of healing. Eventually he was seen as a second Elijah. The colonial powers arrested

⁷⁵ “History,” The Apostolic Faith Mission of SA, available online at <http://www.afm-ags.org/history>, accessed April 8, 2016.

AFM Apostolic Faith Mission

⁷⁶ For a brief history of the Apostolic Faith Mission, see Lyton Chandomba, *The History of Apostolic Faith Mission and Other Pentecostal Missions in South Africa* (Keyes, UK: AuthorHouse, 2007).

⁷⁷ Kalu, *African Pentecostalism*, 61–64.

⁷⁸ See the discussion in *ibid.*, 65–83.

AIC African Initiated Churches

AIC African Initiated Churches

⁷⁹ Akinade, Akintunde, “New Religious Movements in Contemporary Nigeria: Aladura Churches as a Case Study,” *Asian Journal of Theology* 10 (1996): 316–32. Also Jegede Gabriel Gbenga, “The Church of the Lord (Aladura, CLA),” *The Social Sciences* 5 (2010): 89–95.

AIC African Initiated Churches

⁸⁰ On Harris, see *Dictionary of African Christian Biography*, s.v. “Wade Harris, William,” by David A. Shank, available online at http://www.dacb.org/stories/liberia/legacy_harris.html, accessed April 25, 2016.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

him, accusing him of “insurrection, blasphemy and schism,” and he was imprisoned in 1916. He died soon after his release in early 1918. After his death his followers, numbering in the thousands, broke with the Church Missionary Society and formed Christ Army Church.⁸¹

Simon Kimbangu, of the Belgian Congo, was converted through the influence of the Baptist Missionary Society in 1915. He became a religious worker and soon claimed a vision that called him to become a healer. Followers claimed he could heal the sick and raise the dead. His Baptist mentors and the civil authorities both considered Kimbangu dangerous, but for different reasons—religious and political. Many Africans felt that Christianity withheld certain secrets that were the cause of European prosperity. The Baptist instructors felt that his teaching went beyond biblical boundaries. The Belgian authorities believed that Kimbangu and his followers were threatening an uprising. Plans were laid to arrest him, but he escaped. Kimbangu later turned himself in to authorities. He was convicted and sentenced to death for sedition. However, Belgium’s king, Leopold II (1835–1909), commuted his sentence to life in prison and 120 lashes.⁸² He was sent into exile, 1,000 miles from his home and died after 30 years in prison. His son Joseph Diangienda (b. 1918) assumed leadership of the movement, The Church of Jesus Christ on Earth. While neither Braide nor Kimbangu had any known Pentecostal connections, both have been embraced by global Pentecostalism as early African examples.⁸³

Contemporary African Pentecostalism

Pentecostalism has flourished in Africa in the past century. From an insignificant beginning to now comprising about one quarter of the African population, Pentecostals are present in all sub-Saharan African countries. Reasons for its success in Africa are numerous. Among the most significant is the preaching ministry of Reinhard Bonnke (b. 1940). His African ministry commenced as AFM missionary in Lesotho in 1967. There he claimed a vision in which God told him that Africa would be saved. Bonnke began an itinerate ministry that has carried him around Africa and across the globe delivering the

⁸¹ Israel O. Olofinjana, *Twenty Pentecostal Pioneers in Nigeria*, (n.p., 2011), 1:1–10. Also Chinonyerem Chijioke Ekebuisi, *The Life and Ministry of Prophet Garrick Sokari Braide: Elijah the Second of Niger Delta, Nigeria (c. 1882–1918)* (Bern, Switzerland: Peter Lang, 2015).

⁸² The legacy of Leopold II and the Congo Free State is one great travesties of modern African history. As many as 10 million people died as a result of his management and pillaging of the region’s resources for his own personal gain. See Matthew G. Stanard, *The Selling of the Congo: A History of European Pro-Empire Propaganda and the Making of the Belgian Imperialism* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska, 2012).

⁸³ On Kimbangu’s Pentecostal connections, see Walter J. Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism: Origins and Worldwide Development* (Peabody, MA: Hendricksen, 1997), 54–80.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Pentecostal message, claiming 74 million converts in the past 41 years, most of them from Africa.⁸⁴

The Prosperity Gospel has also played a major influence in Africa. In a world where poverty dominates, the PG is attractive as a potential way out of the despair. Yet the PG takes advantage of the very people it offers to help.⁸⁵ Some of the wealthiest Africans are Prosperity preachers.⁸⁶ The PG has become ubiquitous in sub-Saharan Africa.⁸⁷

PENTECOSTALISM IN LATIN AMERICA

Pentecostalism's influence in Latin America has been significant. At one time, Roman Catholicism was the dominant presence in most countries. Latin America is home to about 40% of global Catholics. In the past 100 years, Latin America has dropped from being 90% Roman Catholic to 69%. Currently, two thirds of all Protestants identify as Pentecostals. Like Africa and Asia, Pentecostalism is pervasive across Latin America.⁸⁸

Pentecostalism in Chile

Azusa Street played a role in Chile's pentecostalization. Willis and Mary Hoover read Minnie Abrams *Baptism of the Holy Ghost & Fire* in 1907⁸⁹ and experienced Spirit-baptism. Hoover was forced to resign from the Methodist Mission Board, though he was clearly an effective missionary. He gathered followers and formed Iglesia Metodista Pentecostal.

⁸⁴ See the Christ for the Nations website at <https://cfan.org/content/eoy/2015/>, accessed May 8, 2016.

PG Prosperity Gospel

PG Prosperity Gospel

⁸⁵ Feumba Samen, "The Prosperity Gospel in Africa," *World Magazine*, November 15, 2014, available online at http://www.worldmag.com/2014/11/the_prosperity_gospel_in_africa/page2, accessed May 8, 2016.

⁸⁶ Mfonobong Nsehe, "The Five Richest Pastors in Nigeria," *Forbes.Com*, June 7, 2011, available online at <http://www.forbes.com/sites/mfonobongnsehe/2011/06/07/the-five-richest-pastors-in-nigeria/#2cf5364e4d6b>, accessed May 8, 2016. See also "Of Prophets and Profits," *The Economist*, October 4, 2014, available online at <http://www.economist.com/node/21621885/print>, accessed May 8, 2016.

⁸⁷ Conrad Mbewe, "Prosperity Teaching Has Replaced True Gospel in Africa," *The Gospel Coalition*, June 25, 2015, available online at <https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/article/prosperity-teaching-has-replaced-true-gospel-in-africa>, accessed May 8, 2016.

⁸⁸ "Religion in Latin America," Pew Research Center, November 13, 2014, available online at <http://www.pewforum.org/2014/11/13/religion-in-latin-america/>, accessed April 27, 2016. See also David Masci, "Why has Pentecostalism grown so dramatically in Latin America?" Pew Research Center, November 14, 2014, available online at <http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2014/11/14/why-has-pentecostalism-grown-so-dramatically-in-latin-america/>, accessed April 27, 2016.

⁸⁹ On Abrams, see below.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

While Methodism remained fairly insignificant in Chile, Pentecostalism flourished.⁹⁰ By 2006, approximately 30% of Chileans were renewalists. Of those who claimed to be Protestant, about two thirds considered themselves renewalist while about 25% of Catholics in Chile were Charismatic.⁹¹

Pentecostalism in Brazil

Brazilian Pentecostalism is even more significant. The fifth largest country in the world, Brazil is also the world's largest Roman Catholic nation. As of 2010, Catholics represent about 123 million of Brazil's population of 190 million, or about 65% of the population. According to recent estimates, Brazil's population now stands at just under 204 million. The renewalists account for 110 million, of which 63.4 million are Charismatics with a substantial portion of these being Roman Catholic. There are 26.7 million classic Pentecostals with an additional 19.8 million neo-Charismatics.⁹²

Pentecostalism also came to Brazil in the aftermath of Azusa Street. Adolf Gunnar Vingren⁹³ and Daniel Berg (1884–1963),⁹⁴ Swedish missionaries, surrendered for service under William Durham of Chicago⁹⁵ and arrived in Brazil in November 1910. Both were Baptists and were introduced to Pentecostalism at a conference at First Swedish Baptist Church of Chicago. They both worked in Baptist churches in Brazil until their Pentecostalism caused a schism. For the next ten years, they labored to start the Brazilian Assembly of God, the church that became the mother church for the Assembléia de Deus in Brazil. Today, the AG of Brazil has more than 12 million adherents and is the largest Protestant group in the country.⁹⁶

⁹⁰ For a first-hand account, see W. C. Hoover, *History of the Pentecostal Revival in Chile*, trans. Mario G. Hoover (Santiago, Chile: Imprenta Eben-Ezer, 2000). See also David Bundy, "Unintended Consequences: The Methodist Episcopal Missionary Society and the Beginnings of Pentecostalism in Norway and Chile," *Missiology* 27 (April 1999), 211–29; and Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism*, 117–31.

⁹¹ *Spirit and Power: A 10-Country Survey of Pentecostals*, Pew Charitable Trust, 2007, available online at <http://www.pewforum.org/files/2006/10/pentecostals-08.pdf>, accessed February 5, 2015.

⁹² Recent data on Brazil's renewalist population courtesy of Todd Johnson, World Christian Database, Gordon Conwell Center for the Global Study of Christianity, February 5, 2015 (email to the author). About one half of the Roman Catholics in 2006 identified themselves as Charismatics (see *Spirit and Power*, 76).

⁹³ On Vingren, see *NIDPCM*, s.v. "Vingren, Adolf Gunnar," by J. Colletti, 872.

⁹⁴ On Berg, see *NIDPCM*, s.v. "Berg, Daniel," by J. Colletti, 54–55.

⁹⁵ Durham visited Azusa Street in March 1907 and claimed his baptism, returning to Chicago to lead in the early years of Pentecostal expansion. One of his protégés was the young future missionary to China, Aimie Kennedy Semple (McPherson) (Edith Blumhofer, "William Durham: Years of Creativity, Years of Dissent" in *Portraits of a Generation*, 123–42).

⁹⁶ On early Pentecostal history in Brazil, see Paul Freston, "Pentecostalism in Brazil: A Brief History," *Religion* 25 (1995): 119–33.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Another early Pentecostal influence in Brazil was Luigi Francesconi (1866–1964), an Italian immigrant who came to Chicago in 1890. He was converted from Roman Catholicism and joined the First Italian Presbyterian Church. In August of 1907, Francesconi attended a service conducted by Durham and claimed Spirit-baptism. Durham prophesied that Francesconi would preach the Pentecostal message to the Italians. Francesconi saw himself as a missionary not to a geographic location but to a people—his own Italian people. He visited Italian churches around the United States, spreading the Pentecostal message. After helping to start Pentecostal churches here, he sailed to Argentina and facilitated the birth of Pentecostalism there in 1909. In 1910, he moved to Sao Paulo, Brazil and began preaching in an Italian Presbyterian church. His message soon brought about a split. From this splinter group would emerge the Congregacioni Christiani, one of the largest Pentecostal churches in Brazil. It has since indigenized and spread well beyond the original Italian constituency.

Two additional waves of Pentecostal activity have contributed to making Brazilian Pentecostalism one of the most influential Christian movements in the country. The Church of the Foursquare Gospel (Igreja do Evangelho Quadrangular—IEQ) had roots among Aimee Semple McPherson's Los Angeles group.⁹⁷ The Foursquare Church reached Brazil in 1953 through the efforts of missionary Harold Williams. A third wave of Pentecostalism to hit Brazil came in the late 1970s with the founding of the Universal Church of the Kingdom of God founded by Bishop Edir Macedo. Today, the church boasts more than 5,000 assemblies in Brazil with churches in more than 100 other countries. Along with tongues, they believe in the continuation of apostles and prophets and that divine healing is an “integral part” of the Gospel.⁹⁸

Even Roman Catholics are concerned about the growth of Pentecostalism in Brazil. The concern is that Brazil, the world's largest Catholic nation, stands to lose its Catholic-majority status in the next twenty years. At one time, Brazil was 99% Roman Catholic. In recent years, that number has dropped to 63% and it is poised to dip lower as Pentecostalism grows.⁹⁹

⁹⁷ On “Sister Aimee” as she was called, see Edith L. Blumhofer, *Aimee Semple McPherson: Everybody's Sister* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1993).

⁹⁸ For a discussion of these second and third waves, see Freston, “Pentecostalism in Brazil.” For more on the Universal Church of the Kingdom of God, consult their website, www.uckg.org, where their doctrinal statement and a brief summary of the history may be found (accessed February 5, 2015).

⁹⁹ R. Andrew Chestnut, “How the Charismatic Movement Conquered Brazil, *Catholic Herald*, July 26, 2013, available online at <http://www.catholicherald.co.uk/features/2013/07/26/how-the-charismatic-movement-conquered-brazil/>, accessed February 5, 2015.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

PENTECOSTALISM IN ASIA¹⁰⁰

Asia is the most populous part of the world with the two largest countries—China and India. While neither country is Christian, both have substantial Christian populations. Despite India's Hindu majority, there has been a Pentecostal presence in that vast country since the late 19th century. India prohibits foreign missionaries and is contemplating laws prohibiting proselyting. Nevertheless, Pentecostalism is alive and well.¹⁰¹

PENTECOSTALISM IN INDIA

Christianity in India dates to the Apostolic era when Thomas may have preached on the southwest coast near Goa. German Lutherans and William Carey evangelized India in the 18th century. In the 19th century, several Pentecostal-like movements occurred.

Early Indian Pentecostalism

Between 1860–1880, pietistic missionaries from the Church Missionary Society began ministries in Tirunelveli and Travancore. In 1860, an awakening occurred in Tirunelveli that was “accompanied with prophecy, glossolalia, glosso-graphia, and the interpretation of tongues” with shaking, dreams and visions, and people falling down. A similar awakening happened in Travancore (Kerala) in 1874–1875. The leader was an Anglican-trained Indian named John Christian Aroolappen. One of Aroolappen's converts was a Brahmin, Justin Joseph, who started the Revival Church in 1875. The awakenings were indigenous in character and Pentecostal in theology, but they faded almost as quickly as they began.¹⁰²

After the Welsh Revival, enthusiasm swept churches affiliated with some of the European missionary societies working in India. A book on the Welsh Revival, *The Great Revival*, was translated into Tamil, Telugu, and Kannada, bringing more excitement, first among the Khassia Hills people of northeast India and later at the Muktai Mission of Pandita Ramabai (1858–1922) of South India. As a young woman she accepted Christianity. She

¹⁰⁰ For a survey of Pentecostalism in Asia, see *Spirit and Power: A 10-Country Survey of Pentecostals* (The PEW Forum, October 2006), available online at <http://www.pewforum.org/2006/10/05/overview-pentecostalism-in-asia/>, accessed April 27, 2016.

¹⁰¹ With the new Modi government, Indian believers are afraid that the ability to evangelize will be curtailed. See “India's Government Advocates Anti-Proselytization Law,” December 12, 2014, available online at <http://www.ucanews.com/news/indias-government-advocates-anti-proselytization-law/72610>, accessed February 5, 2015.

¹⁰² For a history of early Pentecostalism in India including pre-Pentecostal movements, see *NIDPCM*, s.v. “India,” by G. M. McGee and S. M. Burgess, 118ff. Also Stanley M. Burgess, “Pentecostalism in India: An Overview,” *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 4 (2001), 85–98 and *Encyclopedia of Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity*, s.v. “India,” by Michael Bergunder, 249–52.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

journeyed to England and then to the United States where she organized the Ramabai Association to sponsor a mission for Indian women, targeting the daughters of Reformed Hindus and high-caste widows who were often blamed for the death of their husbands. By 1896, the Muktai Mission had a few converts because of Ramabai's quiet example. She established orphanages for girls and ministered to women in times of famine.

In 1905, a revival broke out at Muktai when one of her girls claimed the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Others were "slain in the Spirit" or spoke in tongues. At the center was Minnie Abrams (1859–1912) of the Methodist Foreign Missionary Society. She joined Ramabai's mission at Kedgaon. When Ramabai heard of a 1903 Keswick Conference in Australia featuring R. A. Torrey, she sent her daughter and Abrams to investigate. It was here that they learned of the promised end-time revival. Once word of the Welsh Revival came, the Muktai Mission claimed its own outpouring. Abrams received the baptism of the Spirit and took a band of girls who also received the Spirit out to share the word. Soon as many as 100,000 female evangelists promoted Pentecostal experience around India.¹⁰³ Abrams returned to the United States and recruited more women to return with her to India.¹⁰⁴

Pentecostalism in India after 1906

The Azusa Street excitement reached India and reshaped Christianity there. In 1907, Alfred and Lillian Garr arrived. Alfred (1874–1944), raised a Baptist, was converted at fifteen and felt called to preach. Realizing he needed training, he enrolled at Center College at Danville, KY, later transferring to Asbury in Wilmore. There he met and wed Lillian Anderson, daughter of a Methodist bishop. After Asbury, he was called to Burning Bush Mission of Los Angeles. He learned of the revival at Azusa Street, becoming the first white preacher to claim the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Soon Lillian experienced her own baptism. His church refused to accept his new experience, so he resigned. Within a week, he decided to go to India as a missionary. These were the days of the missionary with the one-way ticket. Early Pentecostals, believing that they were speaking in foreign languages, felt that they would be able to travel overseas and the Spirit would give them ability to speak in local languages. Both claimed to speak in Bengali and Lillian also claimed ability in Tibetan and Chinese.¹⁰⁵ Going to language school and raising support

¹⁰³ On Abrams, see Gary B. McGee, "Baptism of the Holy Ghost and of Fire: The Mission Legacy of Minnie Abrams," *Missiology* 28 (October 1999): 515–22. Also idem., "Baptism of the Holy Ghost and Fire! The Revival Legacy of Minnie F. Abrams," *Enrichment Journal*, available online at http://enrichmentjournal.ag.org/199803/080_baptism_fire.cfm, accessed February 4, 2015. Also Gary B. McGee, "Minnie F. Abrams: Another Context, Another Founder," in *Portraits of a Generation*, 87–104.

¹⁰⁴ For a discussion on the influence of Abrams on mission theory, see Dana L. Robert, *American Women in Missions: A Social History of Their Thought and Practice* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1997), 244–48.

¹⁰⁵ Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, 59.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

were considered unnecessary. God would lead these missionaries, meeting their every need. When the Garrs testified of their calling at Azusa Street, the crowd gave them several hundred dollars for travel expenses. They arrived in Calcutta in December 1906 but found they had no ability to speak the local languages and soon ran out of money. Rather than quit as other Pentecostals had done, they persevered. Eventually Garr was invited to preach at William Carey's former church at Bow Bazar. Funds for their support were donated and additional ministry opportunities opened up for them, not among the nationals but among the missionary community. Soon other missionaries testified of their Spirit baptisms. Within six years, the Pentecostal message spread to mission stations across India. "The one way that India can be reached is by getting the missionaries baptized with the Holy Spirit."¹⁰⁶ The Garrs visited Pandita Ramabai at Muktai, preached at Bombay and eventually at Colombo, Ceylon (modern Sri Lanka). In October 1907, they took the Pentecostal message to Hong Kong. Garr also preached the glories of Pentecostalism in Japan and China.¹⁰⁷

Pentecostalism in India in Recent Years

Much of the later Pentecostal work in India has taken place in South India.¹⁰⁸ Kerala has a long Christian history dating back to Thomas and has had a greater Christian population than other parts of India. Missionaries in northern India generally had a more difficult time and the works that flourished tended to be those with less western influence. "It is fair to say that India has responded less favorably to Christian culture imposed from abroad than to those forms that have a more indigenous base."¹⁰⁹ India has also had its own version of Catholic Charismaticism.¹¹⁰

PENTECOSTALISM IN CHINA

The history of Christianity in China dates to the 7th century with the coming of Nestorian monks via the Silk Route into the Xi'an area. China has struggled to embrace Christianity since then, sometimes rejecting it while at other times cautiously embracing it.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁶ Cited in Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, 90.

¹⁰⁷ For biographical information on Garr, see *NIDPCM*, "Garr, Alfred Goodrich, Sr.," by G. B. McGee, 328–29.

¹⁰⁸ On Pentecostalism in South India, see Michael Bergunder, *The South India Pentecostal Movement in the Twentieth Century* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008); and McGee and Burgess, "India," 118–26.

¹⁰⁹ Burgess, "Pentecostalism in India," 94.

¹¹⁰ McGee and Burgess, "India," 124–25.

¹¹¹ For the best recent history, see Daniel E. Bays, *A New History of Christianity in China* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012).

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Early Chinese Pentecostalism

Pentecostalism in China¹¹² also traces its lineage to Azusa Street. In the south, Alfred and Lillian Garr took the Pentecostal message to Hong Kong at the invitation of several single women missionaries, Eliza May Law and Rosa Pittman. They had been part of a missionary entourage originally headed to Japan whose burden changed to China after claiming the “Hongkong dialect” as their tongues gift. The Pentecostal movement in south China struggled, first because the Garrs did not stay long enough to do effective work and also because their linguistic “gift” failed to materialize.

Pentecostals in the north of China fared slightly better. Again Azusa Street provided the impetus. A Norwegian by birth, Bernt Berntsen (1863–1933) immigrated to the United States in 1893. He journeyed to China as part of a non-denominational missionary effort in 1904. He read about Azusa Street in an early issue of *Apostolic Faith* and decided to return to the United States to see things for himself. After claiming his Spirit baptism in September 1907, he and 11 recruits made their way back to China carrying the Pentecostal message. Berntsen also made contact with nascent Scandinavian Pentecostalism from whom he solicited more evangelists for China.¹¹³

Later Pentecostalism in China

Local Chinese pastors embraced Pentecostalism during the early 20th century. Wei Enbo (1877–1919), founder of the True Jesus Church, and Wang Mingdao (1900–1991), pastor of the Christian Tabernacle of Beijing, one of the largest unregistered churches during the early Communist era, both claimed a Pentecostal experience.¹¹⁴ The Communist Revolution (1949) did much to thwart Christianity. Attempts were made either to destroy Christianity altogether or at least to bring it to heel under the control of the state.¹¹⁵ Believers resisted attempts to obliterate it either by going underground or with the help

¹¹² For a current discussion on Pentecostalism in China, see Robert Menzies, “Pentecostalism in China,” in *Global Renewal Christianity: Asia and Oceania Spirit Empowered Movements: Past, Present, and Future*, ed. Amos Young and Vinson Synan (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2016), 67–90.

¹¹³ The history of Pentecostalism in this paragraph and the preceding one is gleaned from R. G. Tiedemann, “The Origins and Organizational Developments of the Pentecostal Missionary Enterprise in China,” *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 14 (2011): 108–46. On Berntsen, see Iap Sian-Chin, “Bernt Berntsen: A Prominent Oneness Pentecostal Pioneer to North China,” *Global Renewal ... Asia*, 91–106.

¹¹⁴ Rodney Stark and Xiuhua Wang, *A Star in the East: The Rise of Christianity in China* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 57, 63. On Mingdao, see Thomas Alan Harvey, *Acquainted with Grief* (Grand Rapids: Brazos, 2002).

¹¹⁵ On this aspect of Chinese Christian history, see David Aikman, *Jesus in Beijing* (Washington, DC: Regnery, 2003).

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

of outsiders who smuggled Bibles or transmitted the Gospel via the airways into the country.

Pentecostals were among those who wished to carry the Christian message into the mainland. The growth of Pentecostalism among Chinese Christians mushroomed under the influence of Dennis Balcombe, an American-born church planter in Hong Kong.¹¹⁶ Balcombe arrived in Hong Kong in 1969 with a burden to spread Pentecostalism in China. As the grip of Communism lessened after the death of Mao and the during the era of Deng Xiaoping, Balcombe smuggled Bibles and began itinerant preaching especially in Henan Province, often one step ahead of the law.¹¹⁷ Gradually his Pentecostal influence spread to the point that four of the largest house church groups issued a Confession of Faith that rejected cessationism.¹¹⁸ Pentecostalism has continued to spread throughout China so that today it is one of the most important influences on Chinese Christianity, perhaps being its dominant form in rural areas.¹¹⁹

Other Asian countries show significant Pentecostal presence. South Korea is home to Yoido Full Gospel Church. By 2000, nine of the largest churches in the country were Pentecostal.¹²⁰ The Philippines is the only “Christian” nation in Asia. Pentecostalism has shown significant growth here as well. While numbers are hard to ascertain, according to one recent report, the Assemblies of God is the largest evangelical body with an estimated 2,600 churches and 420,000 members in 2004.¹²¹ Pentecostalism today is a major movement in Asia.

CONCLUSION

Many voices objected to John MacArthur’s attack on Pentecostalism. Prominent pastors showed up at the conference to hand out literature in protest.¹²² Pentecostals rushed

¹¹⁶ Ibid., 82.

¹¹⁷ For more on Balcombe’s Pentecostal influence in China, see Dennis Balcombe, *China’s Opening Door: Incredible Stories of the Holy Spirit at Work in One of the Greatest Revivals in Christianity* (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2014); or idem, *One Journey, One Nation: Autobiography of Dennis Balcombe Missionary to China* (Chambersburg, PA: eGenCo, 2011).

¹¹⁸ Article Five, On the Holy Spirit, “Confession of Faith,” in Aikman, *Jesus in Beijing*, 318.

¹¹⁹ Bays, *Christianity in China*, 194.

¹²⁰ “An Overview of Pentecostalism in South Korea,” <http://www.pewforum.org/2006/10/05/historical-overview-of-pentecostalism-in-south-korea/>, accessed April 27, 2016.

¹²¹ Joseph Suico, “Pentecostalism in the Philippines,” in *Asian and Pentecostal*, 352.

¹²² Alecia MacKenzie, “Mark Driscoll ‘Crashes’ John MacArthur’s Strange Fire Conference?” *BuzzVine* (*The Christian Post*), October 18, 2013, available online at <http://www.christianpost.com/buzzvine/mark-driscoll-crashes-john-macarthur-strange-fire-conference-photos-106976/>, accessed April 27, 2016.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

responses into print.¹²³ Even would-be friends averred that MacArthur misspoke.¹²⁴ Some seemed to argue that the continuationist/cessationist issue is a matter of *adiaphora*—things indifferent and hence disruptive to the evangelical fold. “This divisive nonsense hurts the church.”¹²⁵ MacArthur’s conference definitely struck a nerve in the evangelical world.

Since the beginning of the 20th century, Pentecostalism has sparked heated debate among Christians—especially among evangelicals. Serious questions need to be addressed: Are Pentecostals evangelicals? No doubt many are. But clearly many Pentecostals are heretics: Oneness Pentecostalism, for instance, denies the Trinity. Yet these heretical groups are treated as a part of the larger Pentecostal whole. What of Charismatic Catholics? Serious doctrinal issues are at stake for evangelicals relative to Roman Catholicism. Pentecostalism seems to serve as a new ecumenism, bridging divides that heretofore seemed impassible.¹²⁶ Additionally, Pentecostals claim that they are the recipients of the Holy Spirit unlike other Christians. What they possess, the rest of the Church needs. If this is the case, then why are so many *Spirit-filled* Christians so sinful? Parham was a racist, McPherson was sensationalist, a divorcee, and perhaps an adulterer. Florence Crawford abandoned her family. Prominent cases of adultery and other sexual indiscretions abound in the history of Pentecostalism. At least one group, the Church of God, went to court to fight over the control of its name after a major split. Of course these kinds of behaviors exist among other professing Christians, like Baptists and Catholics. But the presence of so much high profile unholy living seems strange among people convinced that they possess the Holy Spirit to a greater degree than their fellows Christians.

¹²³ Michael L. Brown, *Authentic Fire: A Response to John MacArthur’s Strange Fire* (Lake Mary, FL: Creation House, 2015). Also *Strangers to Fire: When Tradition Trumps Scripture*, ed. Robert W. Graves (n.p.: The Foundations for Pentecostal Scholarship, 2014) and R. T. Kendall, *Holy Fire: A Balanced, Biblical Look at the Holy Spirit’s Work in Our Lives* (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma, 2014).

¹²⁴ See Thomas Schreiner, Review of *Strange Fire: The Danger of Offending the Holy Spirit with Counterfeit Worship* by John MacArthur, October 28, 2013, available online at https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/article/strange_fire, accessed April 27, 2016.

¹²⁵ Barnabas Piper, “MacArthur vs. Driscoll: It’s Discouraging to Young Christians Like Me,” *World*, October 25, 2013, available online at http://www.worldmag.com/2013/10/macarthur_v_driscoll_it_s_discouraging_to_young_christians_like_me, accessed May 2, 2016.

¹²⁶ Jean-Daniel Plüss, “Pentecostalism and Ecumenism of the Spirit,” a paper delivered at the 48th International Ecumenical Seminar, July 2–9, 2015, Strasbourg, France, available online at <http://www.strasbourg-institute.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/Pentecostalism-and-Ecumenism-of-the-Spirit.pdf>, accessed May 5, 2016. Also Cecil R. Robeck, “Ecumenism,” *Studying Global Pentecostalism: Theories and Methods*, ed. Allan Anderson, et al. (Berkeley, CA: University of California, Berkeley, 2010), 286–307.

Lion and Lamb Apologetics'

Pentecostalism, if it is biblical, needs to be embraced by *all* Christians and regulated by the Scriptures. However, Pentecostals themselves cannot figure out who is in and who is out of their own movement. There is no Pentecostal consensus on tongues as the initial evidence of the Holy Spirit.¹²⁷ Is tongues merely glossolalia or is it also or primarily xenolalia? There is no Pentecostal consensus on the prosperity gospel.¹²⁸ Pentecostals themselves argue that the PG is wreaking havoc in places like Africa,¹²⁹ while at the same time they promote the very people responsible.¹³⁰

Evangelicals of all stripes seemingly fail to grasp the gravity of the situation. Global Pentecostalism is a vast, amorphous movement that shows no signs of abating and every sign of continuing its march toward global Christian domination even, or perhaps especially, among evangelicalism. Since the 1940s, evangelicals first flirted with, and now whole-heartedly embrace Pentecostalism as God's *modus operandi*. It dominates our major theologies and influences our mission movement¹³¹ while erstwhile cessationists join hands with its supporters. Clearly cessationism is waning as evangelicalism moves into its twilight years. Some might suggest this is a good thing. Others have made the case that if the Pentecostal understanding of the Holy Spirit is unbiblical, then those who endorse the movement and promote it are in danger of "offending the Holy Spirit with counterfeit worship."¹³²

¹²⁷ *Initial Evidence: Historical and Biblical Perspectives on the Pentecostal Doctrine of Spirit Baptism*, ed. Gary B. McGee (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1991).

¹²⁸ To his credit, J. Lee Grady, editor of *Charisma*, has "been fighting it for years" (Sarah Pulliam Bailey, A Voice for Sanity," *Christianity Today*, November 23, 2009, available online at <http://www.christianitytoday.com/ct/2009/november/33.42.html>, accessed May 2, 2016.

PG Prosperity Gospel

¹²⁹ J. Lee Grady, "5 Ways the Prosperity Gospel Is Hurting Africa," *Charisma*, November 13, 2013, available online at <http://www.charismamag.com/blogs/fire-in-my-bones/19113-5-ways-the-prosperity-gospel-is-hurting-africa>, accessed May 2, 2016.

¹³⁰ Ken Walker, "Joyce Meyer: Multifaceted Ministry Anointed by the Holy Spirit," *Charisma*, August 19, 2015, available online at <http://www.charismamag.com/anniversary/40-who-radically-changed-our-world/23934-joyce-meyer-multifaceted-ministry-anointed-by-the-holy-spirit>, accessed May 2, 2016.

¹³¹ The current evangelical missions movement has tacitly, or perhaps overtly, embraced many aspects of Pentecostalism. Missions textbooks speak of discerning God's will through visions and conducting "spiritual warfare" as a mission strategy. The Pentecostalization of global Christianity is included as a field of study in mission history. All of these may be found, sometimes without criticism, in A. Scott Moreau, et al., *Introducing World Missions: A Biblical, Historical, and Practical Survey*, 2nd ed. (Grand Rapids: Baker, 2015), 138, 149, and 273.

¹³² Straub, J. P. (2016). "The Pentecostalization of Global Christianity and the Challenge for Cessationism," *Detroit Baptist Seminary Journal*, 21, 207-234.